Enhancing Staff Recruitment Efficiency and Operational Performance within Nigeria's Local Government Framework: A Case Study of Enugu State (1999-2021)

Anikwe Johnson Azubuike, Ogbuka Ikenna Matthew and Nnamani Felix Vincent

Department of Political Science Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities Enugu State University of Science and Technology (ESUT) Enugu, Nigeria.

ABSTRACT
Recruitment have become a fundamental tool in achieving productivity in any organization. However, the quality of staff in an organisation is one of the factors that determine how the organization is going to be successful in terms of realizing its objectives of increased productivity, efficiency and effectiveness in terms of service delivery. This study examined staff recruitment and productivity in local government system in Enugu State 1999-2021. The study was guided by two research questions and two hypotheses, the objective of the study was to ascertain the relationship between staff recruitment and productivity in the local government system in Enugu State. The researcher adopted descriptive survey design. The researcher also utilized Human Resource Management Theory to extrapolate the study. The population for the study was 4,411,100 residents of Enugu State. Also, sample for the study was 450 respondents. Multi stage sampling techniques were adopted for the study. A self-structured questionnaire was used to collect data. Frequency and standard deviation was used for data analysis. The findings indicated that there is a relationship between staff recruitment and low productivity in local government system in Enugu State. The study concluded that, there is a dire need for a review of recruitment processes in the local government in Enugu State to enhance productivity.

Keywords: Staff Recruitment, Productivity, Local Government System and Nigeria

INTRODUCTION
The creation of local government anywhere in the world stems from the need to facilitate development at the grassroots. The importance of local government is a function of its ability to generate a sense of belonging, safety and satisfaction among its populace. The Nigerian state therefore, created local government as the third tier of government whose objective is to ensure effective participation and promotion of government policies and programmes at the grassroots [1]. Local government as a tier of government was first introduced in Nigeria in 1900 with the introduction of 1900 Native Ordinance [2]. However, in 1976 efforts were made to reform and unify the local government system in Nigeria. The 1976 local government reform in Nigeria defined local government as the government at the local level exercised through representative councils, established by law to perform specific functions within a defined area. These powers should give the councils substantial control over local affairs as well as staff, institutional and financial power to initiate and direct the provision of services, determine and implement projects so as to compliment the activities of the state and federal government in the areas and to ensure devolution of functions to these councils and through the active participation of the people and their traditional institutions, that local initiatives and responses to local needs and conditions are maximized [1]. Accordingly, [3] summarized the objectives of local government according to 1976 reform to include:

(a) to make appropriate services and development activities responsive to local wishes and initiate by developing and delegating them to local representative bodies,

(b) to facilitate the exercise of democratic self-government close to the local levels of our society and to encourage initiatives and leadership potentials,

(c) to mobilize human and material resources through the involvement of members of the public in their own development and to provide a two way channel of communication between the communities and the government.
Anikwe et al. Association of Local Government of Nigeria \[4\] posits that on global scale, local government has been recognized as a veritable tool or framework for administering local and grassroots areas. Akpan in \[5\] opined that local government simply mean the breaking down of a country into small units or localities for the purpose of administration in which the inhabitants of different units or localities concerned play a direct and full part through their elected representatives who exercise power or undertake functions under the general authority of the national government. \[6\], see local government as a formal institution which performs primary public functions closest to the people. However, the recruitment of staff in any organization, be it public or private sector is of paramount importance to the organization. This is because it is the staff that turns the vision and mission of the organization into reality, thus the objectives of any organization can only be realized through the effective co-ordination of the human resource (staff) of the organization \[7\]. In addition, \[7\] posited that every organization (public or private) depends on the effective use of its available resources in order to achieve its objectives. These resources (human and material) should be in the right quantity, quality, and time if they are to be effectively utilized.

The importance of staff recruitment in the local government system can never be over emphasized. This is because the quality of individuals (staff) in any organization will go a long way to determine the effectiveness and efficiency of services to the people. Accordingly, Butler in \[7\] defined recruitment to mean “scrutinize the right people for particular jobs, and it may take the form of advertising for large groups of employees or track out a rightly skilled individual for specific work.”\[5\], wrote that recruitment is a process of attracting individuals on a timely basis, in sufficient numbers and with appropriate qualifications, developing their interest in an organisation and encouraging them to apply for jobs within it. \[9\]. Perceived recruitment as the process of attracting all potential applicants for a job position within an organization, while \[10\] defined recruitment as the comprehensive act of actively seeking, evaluating, securing commitment from, placing, and orienting new employees to fulfill the positions necessary for the effective functioning of an organization. In the same vein, Fatiregun in \[11\] posits that recruitment is process of assessing a job, announcing the vacancy, arousing interest and stimulating people to apply for the job. While \[12\] wrote that recruitment is the process of generating a pool of qualified applicants for organizational jobs. Moreso, Zweig in \[11\] argued that recruitment is the set of activities an organization uses to select candidates who possess the abilities and attitude necessary for the enterprise especially with the aim of achieving its objectives. Accordingly, \[11\] asserted that recruitment at the local government was no longer what it used to be, there was discrimination and favouritism in the recruitment of local government staff. Recruitment is more than merely filling current vacancies. It aims at obtaining requisite personnel and building a strong organization with effective team work. To that extent, if recruitment policies and practices are to be most effective exercise, it must sought to answer the following fundamental questions: What is the nature of policies guiding recruitment? What procedures should be used to screen candidates for employment? What are the requirements of the job to be filled? What is the use of tools, interviewing and testing in the recruitment procedures, and what is the place of promotion in the procurement of function? Writing on recruitment, \[14\] argued that the success of public sector depends on the employment of the right people in the right number at the right time. Choosing the right person for the job is therefore critical to the success of every organisation. The recruitment of right calibre of people for the job is essential to the overall productivity of the organisation. However, productivity according to Carboys and Temple in \[14\] refers to Metric and Measures of output from productive processes, per unit of input. \[15\] sees labour productivity as typically measured as a ratio of output per labour house. According to \[16\] productivity is the quality or state of output. It is a concept that guides the management of production systems and measure its success. It is the quality that indicates how well labour capital, materials, time, energy are utilized. Also, productivity is commonly defined as a ratio between the input volume and the volume of outputs. In other words, it measures how efficiency in production inputs, such as labour, time, and capital are being used in an economy to produce a given level of output. Productivity is considered as a key source of economic growth, and competitiveness and as such, it is the basic statistical information for many international comparisons and country’s performance assessments. Oguna in \[14\] posited that production is the capacity of a situation where an individual or organization produces maximum results with available human, financial and material resources to achieve set organization objectives. In this regard, efficiency and effectiveness are indices of public organisation while profitability, efficient and effectiveness are the indices of business organization. Incidentally, the abysmal performance of local government since its creation in Nigeria is a thing of concern \[17\]. To that extent, both scholars of political science and management sciences perceived problems of local government as hydra headed. According to \[17\] manpower is the most strategic and potent resource in any organization.
but has not received the desired professional management for the attainment of local government’s contributions towards national development. More than 70% of Nigerians reside in the rural areas where there is acute shortage of social infrastructures and economic needs. In the light of this in 1976, the local government reform was initiated where the local governments were saddled with more functions, responsibilities and finances to correct the anomaly of rural areas challenges [18]. Consequently, lack of performance on the part of local government personnel often result in ineffectiveness of Local Government in national development. That is why the role of local government in national development has always been a question in terms of productivity. The issue becomes worse when problems of development are traced to poor staff recruitment as manifested in the inability to plan and execute government programmes as well as efficient and effective social service delivery. Therefore, for development to be possible, there is the need for the emergence of a sound recruitment process within which adequate, skilled and well motivated workforce should operate. No local government can be efficient and effective if it under rates the critical role that the right people play in achieving goals.

Moreover, the manner of recruitment is questionable as it is based on subjectivity and consideration of sentiment which ultimately enthrones mediocrity and debase meritocracy. For instance, the junior cadre which is grade 01-06, receive salary as low as ₦30,000, at most and this is naturally incapable of attracting well trained staff [17]. Also Lickert posited that “of all the task of management, managing the human component is central and most important task because all else depends on how well it is done.” Accordingly, the personnel management of local government involves the recruitment, appointment, posting, promotion, training and discipline of its employees for the purpose of attainment of its goals. There is hierarchy of officials and institution which are responsible for the personnel management duties of the local government. This ranges from the Chairman, Secretary, Supervisors, Administrative, Heads of department and Head of Personnel Management, Junior Staff Management Committee and the Local Government Service Commission. Even the Department of Local Government Affairs in the Governor’s Office is also involved in these personnel management functions as it has the responsibility for local government personnel training [17]. The productivity level of the local government staff has been greatly affected. This is usually found in all the local government areas in the country where staff productivity were usually very low owing to some challenges facing the local government. Although it was expected that the coming of democracy in 1999 will make local government responsive to local needs. In Enugu State, there was recruitment of local government staff under the administration of Governor Chimaroke Nnamani in 2001. One of the observers Okoli Sussan stated that, the 2002 local government recruitment was publicly advertised but that did not stop the politicians and senior staff from bringing in their family and friends. She also remarked that in 2006, 2012 and other subsequent times, the local government witnessed infux of staff without proper advertisement. She concluded by saying that each local government chairman usually recruit staff at well. To her, there was no proper process of recruitment of staff in the local government in Enugu State. Moreso, Nweke Sunday a staff of Uzo-Uwani local government maintained that the recruitment in 2002, 2006 and other times were politicized in such a way that the politicians of that era used local government recruitment to settle their allies and siblings. Accordingly, other recruitments and replacements at the local government followed the same suit. It is against this background that the researcher delved into this study: Staff recruitment and Productivity in the local government system. A case study of Enugu State 1999 – 2021.

Statement of the Problem

It is argued that the quality of an organizations personnel is one of the factors that determine how the organisation is going to be successful in terms of realizing its objectives of increased productivity, efficiency and effectiveness. Also, one of the most effective ways of ensuring high standard of performance in any organization is through recruitment of qualified candidates [11]. In this regard, it has been argued that a well-articulated recruitment of qualified staff leads to increase in productivity, heightened morale, reduce supervision and increased efficiency and effectiveness. In spite of the importance of recruitment to increase productivity in any organization be it private or public sector, it has been observed that candidates are not recruited on merit but on favouritism, connection and clannish sentiments which biased the processes of selection of staff into the local governments in Enugu State. [19], asserted that the general inefficiency, ineffectiveness and decline in productivity in the Nigeria public service are likely to be caused by inadequate recruitment procedures in employment of workers and that also includes the local government staff. Despite the enormous powers and resources given to the local government and the corresponding constitutional provisions for attaining efficiency and effectiveness on service delivery at the local level, the deplorable condition of the people in the rural and urban centre where
Research Questions

(1) What is the relationship between staff recruitment and productivity in the local government system of Enugu State?

(2) What is the process of staff recruitment in local government system in Enugu State?

Objective of the Study

The broad objective of the study is to examine staff recruitment and productivity in the local government system of Enugu State. Specifically, the study set:

1. To examine the relationship between staff recruitment and productivity in the local government of Enugu State.

2. To examine the process of staff recruitment in local government system of Enugu State.

Significance of the Study

This study has both theoretical and empirical significance. Empirically, this study will contribute in providing the decision makers and other key actors in the Nigeria local government system with the road-maps that will necessitate responsive and efficient public administration more especially at the local level in matters relating to recruitment of staff. It will also suggest the panacea through which the campaign against politicization of recruitment and selection of staff, corruption, lack of accountability and transparency, poor service delivery and general inefficiency in the Nigeria local government system. It will strategically improve the efficiency and effectiveness of Nigeria local government, its advocacy on reforming, the recruitment procedures in local government more especially in Enugu State. Theoretically, this study will provide future researchers who may wish to embark on staff recruitment and productivity in local government or any related topic with academic material. Also, it will serve as a veritable bibliography/reference for any academic research on recruitment and productivity.

Scope of the Study

This study is limited to staff recruitment and productivity in the local government system in Enugu State. The study covered recruitment and productivity in local government system in Enugu State 1999 to 2021.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Conceptual Review

Recruitment

The term recruitment simply means securing the right people for particular jobs, and it may take the form of advertising for large groups of employees or tackling out a lightly skilled individual for specific work [20]. Also, Crawford in [20] posited that recruitment is a process of attracting individuals on a timely basis in sufficient numbers and with appropriate qualifications, developing their interest in an organization and encouraging them to apply for jobs within it. Recruitment is a set of activities used to obtain a sufficient number of the right people at the right time from the right places [21]. Croft in [22] defined recruitment as the analysis of a job and the features the organization will look for in a potential employee and attracting candidates to apply to the organization and the offering of various terms and conditions of employment to a chosen potential employee. To [23], recruitment is to attract sufficient and suitable potential employees for vacancies in the organization. Recruitment and selection are concerned with filling and keeping filling positions in the organization structure. From the above, the array of definitions by different scholars, a good recruitment process must be one that encourages and motivates a large pool of qualified candidates to apply for a vacant position in an organisation. The process of recruitment and selection begins with the manpower planning, which indicates areas in the organization where there are likely to be shortage of people, and the number of people to be recruited to meet anticipated employment needs [24, 11].

Essential Manpower Planning Processes

According to [24], for recruitment and selection to be effective at any level, the following stages or processes should be followed:

(i) Manpower Assessment: As noted earlier, the process of recruitment and selection begin with the manpower plan, which indicates areas in the organization where there are likely to be shortages of people, and number of people to be recruited to meet organizational employment needs.

(ii) Job Analysis: This involves the examination of what the potential employee will be required to do in any particular job.

(iii) Job Description: Outline in general terms, the activities, tasks and responsibilities involved in a job. It is usually written statement of job content.

(iv) Man Specification: This is a statement of the minimum acceptable human qualities necessary to perform a job properly. It is a standard of personnel and designates the qualities required for acceptable performance.

(v) Attracting Candidates for a Post(s): This can be done either through internal or external sources of job posting.
Anikwe et al

Sources of Recruitment

Scholars argued that the sources of recruitment can be internal or external in any organization to them.

Internal sources: These comprises of the following: Use of skill inventory to locate potential job applicants from among current employees, job post which is a method whereby vacancies are posted on bulletin boards, promotion of subordinates to fill the vacant post and sideways appointment which is simply the system whereby an employee of similar seniority is transferred to another department or area to fill a vacant position in the organization.

External sources: [24] stated that the major sources of external recruitment includes: Direct advertising which means using the job specialist or their own experts to recruit staff, use of government employment agencies, use of private employment bureau, direct from companies staff who possessed the basic skill needed and for the job.

Challenges of Recruitment into Local Government System in Nigeria

However, the recruitment of staff into the local government in Nigeria is a deviation to the principles in management. This is in line with [25] who affirmed that to large extent has negatively affected the quality of service as poor input produces poor output [25]. It has been observed that recruitment in the local government service has been flaw, this is because of the abuse of procedures of employment, imposition of candidates by top public office holders and other powerful citizens in the country. Sometimes, there are cases of replacement rather than employment, this scenario occurs when the staff and management resolved to bring in their people into vacancies without the knowledge of the public [11]. In the same vein, [26] identified a number of factors that inhibit effective recruitment exercise in Nigeria public services to include:

(i) Weak recruitment policies and practices: Wrong recruitment and selection practices such as ethnic, religious, political and other considerations have created a situation where we have garbage in and garbage out or putting of square peg in a round holes.

(ii) Nepotism: One of the banes of the Nigeria public service is the recruitment of mediocre or totally unsuitable candidates in preference to candidates of high merit as a result of favouritism.

(iii) Corruption: This prevalent in public sector where recruitment agents collect money from job seekers.

(iv) Undue emphasis on paper qualification: In Nigeria public sector today most employment requirement is paper qualification. Of course, most of them that possessed degree can hardly read or write without committing grammatical blunder.

(v) Quota system: At the local level, the indigene syndrome, gender, discrimination against women, caste and religious bias constitute a major stumbling block to recruitment.

Concept of Productivity

Productivity is an attitude of mind, it is a mentality of progress, the consistent improvement in a work place. It is the certainty of being able to do better today than yesterday and continuously in realization of goals. It is constant adoption of time, economic and social life to charging conditions, it is the continual efforts to apply new techniques and methods, it is the faith in human [27]. On the other hand, productivity means goods and services produced in a specified period of time in relation to the resource utilized [28]. [27], proposed that a common aspect of the concept of productivity is the depiction of an individual's ability to efficiently produce, as measured by the ratio at which production occurs within an organization. Nezu in [27] opined that labour productivity is one of the most common indices among partial productivities. This index describe the role of labour in manufacturing products or services. More labour productivity indicates better and more useful labour. In the same vein, Salter (1966) accepts the measure of labour productivity as output per man hour because it has a perfectly respectable ancestry. However, productivity is referred as the amount of effort exerted by the civil servants [29]. On the other hand, [30] asserted that productivity is a position resulting from evaluating one’s job experiences and rewarding the individual accordingly. Also, [31], argued that productivity is an attitudes which describes how content an
Anikwe et al. individuals are with their job. [32], in his submission averred, to be more than a narrow economic measure, as it also measure how well the group performs its required tasks to satisfy its customers inside and outside the organization, productivity suggests effectiveness of the employees. [16], stated that productivity is the quality, or state of output. It is a concept that guides the management of production system and measure its success. It is the quality that indicates how well labour, capital, materials, time, energy are utilized. Productivity is commonly defined as a ratio between the input volume and the volume of output. In other words, it measures how efficiently production input, such as labour, time and capital are being used in an economy to produce a given level of output. Productivity is considered as a key source of economic growth, and competitiveness and as such, it is the basic statistical information for many international comparison and country’s performance assessments Krugman in [32]. Also, [32] defined productivity as the ratio of output to the corresponding labour. He places the validity of this definition on its popularity. [34], opined that productivity is used to denote the ratio of output to any or all associated inputs in real terms. [35] defined productivity as the capacity of a situation where an individual or organization produce maximum results with available human, financial and material resources to achieve set organizational objectives. In this sense, efficiency and effectiveness are indices of public organisation while profitability, efficiency and effectiveness are indices of business organisation. Other scholars like [36, 37, 38] among others were of the view that productivity is a goal of every organisation. That, any organisation that cannot operate to a degree of significant productivity is an impotent entity. These scholars contend that any organization that failed in terms of producing greater output in terms of productivity is a wholesome disappointment to its owners. Nevertheless, the productivity of the local government staff (where majority of its outputs are invisible or intangible has prompted some analysts to regard productivity as the ability to accomplish some specific objective output). This was the yard-stick employed when in 1975, several public servants were retired on the ground of declining productivity [39]. Another school of thought regards productivity as being synonymous with the ability to allocate resources judiciously and to avoid waste. While the former stresses achievement of objective(s) the later emphasises economic use of resources. Moreover, I’m bold to state here that there are paucity of empirical studies on productivity measurement in the local government when to compare with what prevails in the state and federal service. One major problem in the bid to increase productivity in local government is the problem of measuring and quantifying productivity in local government. [40] posited that the total lack of work study and work measurement in local government makes it extremely difficult for any serious attention to be paid to productivity. A situation, therefore, exist in the public such that there is a religious adherence to maintaining the status-quo, preoccupation with maintaining of approved establishment in the budget, and insatiable desire for more staff and materials when the existing staff and materials are sub-optimally used [40]. In interim, may proposed that productivity measurement in the local government should be carried out at the micro level, because any meaningful attempt at enhancing productivity in local government at the aggregate level must be done at the individual local government staff level, that is per staff input and output [40]. In the same vein, any meaningful attempt at increasing productivity in the local government must take into consideration the issues of red Taoism and undue endless bureaucratic process, inadequate supervision, absence of incentives, stagnation in particular grade level for a long time, poor attitude of staff, serious underemployment, unclear goal setting, incessant strikes, unreliable water and electricity supply, inadequate attending to training and retraining of staff, obsolete/inadequate machinery or no machine, low worker morale, poor management, unenlightened trade union and government’s lacks of diplomacy on union matters etc. [35]. Accordingly, [41] identified the following as challenges to productivity in the local government as; lack of machines and poor supply of functional equipment, lack of stationeries, unsupportive management system, lack of a career structure, poor housing, inadequate clinical facilities, inadequate pay, lack of recreational facilities, limited schooling opportunities for children. Also, [42] stated that local government workers are often exposed to poor working condition, unsatisfactory hygiene environment and facilities, delay promotion or denial of promotions. Others are lack of accommodation, inadequate lighting, poor and epilectic power supply, lack of sufficient ventilation and shortage of working apparatus. Another challenges of recruitment of staff in the local government as identified by [17] are unlawful discrimination on the grounds of sex, ethnic origin and religion instead of merit, non-consideration of the right attitude in the process of recruitment, undue interference by the politicians and top functionaries in the recruitment process, biasness in the recruitment method by the employers affect the credibility and quality of employee and replacement of retired personnel with their relatives and back door recruitment disrupts staffing process in the local government. For instance in Enugu state, the top management staff replaces retired persons with either the son or wife of the retiree.
The Processes of Recruitment

Anikwe et al. [43], rightly observed that before a recruitment decision can be made, the organization must reflect any vacancy that occurs and link the decisions to the objectives set by the human resources plan of the organization. He further stated that the human resources plan sets a strategy for resourcing the organization and each individual vacancy will need to be linked to the strategy before deciding on how to proceed. Also, [44] noted the organization may be reducing staff, overall, so the vacancy could provide the opportunity to transfer another employee from one over-staffed area to other area where his skill is mostly needed. The promotion and succession plans may have prepared other employees to qualify to the job, so that there is a movement at various levels within the organization. The job, as it stands may need to be re-designed for future work needs or the tasks may be divided up differently. Technology may be introduced or upgraded which could reduce the need for some elements of the job. All these factors needs to be properly considered before the decision to recruit is finally taken.

However, other important aspect of recruitment according to him is therefore, to gain a thorough picture of the requirements of both the job and the individual so that selection criteria can be drawn up. These criteria can then be used to determine if there is a suitable internal candidate and to identify any training needs they may have. In addition, these criteria can also be used for external recruitment and advertising campaigns. Thus, personnel staff should be capable of rearranging their advertising campaigns to meet the particular short term needs of user departments and of being prepared to negotiate interview times to meet the convenience of short listed candidates for key posts. However, it needs to be acknowledged that recruitment is a marketing activity as well as a resourcing one. When recruiting staff, organizations are going out into their external environments and competing with others for suitable recruits [3]. It is important, therefore, as [23] emphasized, that such activities are conducted in a manner that sustains or enhances the public image of the organization. Applicants who are treated both fairly and efficiently will pass on this experience to others, even if they have been unsuccessful in their application. Conversely, people who feel that their application has been dealt in an unfair manner are quick to spread their criticisms around. As a further check on whether a recruitment process is significant and systematic, human resources managers should develop a recruitment checklist they should frequently refer to.

Personnel Specifications and Job Specifications

[43] opined that the purpose of a personnel specification or candidate profile, as it is sometimes called, is to make explicit the attributes that are sought in candidates for the job in question. He argued that the personnel specification becomes a summary of the most important knowledge, skills and personal characteristics required by the successful candidate in order to be able to carry out the acceptable standard of performance. He contend that The specification depends for on its relevance on the nature and scope of the job, as described in the job descriptions and amplified where necessary by comments from the manager concerned. Naturally, the nature of the job determined the type and level of knowledge and skills required. So it is important to have the manager’s view as to the kind of personnel qualities that would permit the new intakes to fit into the team [23].
Recruitment has become increasingly important as on way of delivering behaviours seen as necessary to support organisation to achieve its objective of high productivity. [20], posits that good recruitment practice impacts positively in an organization. Hence it minimize the risk of failing to achieve the business strategy and incurring need less cost as business and organizational strategies can be jeopardized if the people who are appointed are not qualified to handle the job. Also, [16] asserted that effective recruitment and selection can provide significant improvements. In this vein, [45] maintained that the profitability and even the survival of an organization enterprise usually depend upon the calibre of the workforce and it has been argued that the cost of ineffective commercial viability can often be attributed to decades of ineffective recruitment and selection methods [8]. However, organizations are under an obligation to their stakeholders or employer to perform well. To do this, they depend on the quality, dedication, enthusiasm, expertise and skill of the people working for them at all levels. [11], observed that the impact of staff recruitment on organizational productivity can never be overemphasized. This is because of the important role of humans in managing the organizational resources. As it is well established fact that an organization with well trained and skilled personnel tend to deliver organizational goals when compare with untrained and unskilled workers.

Relationship between Staff Recruitment and Productivity

Recruitment is an essential part of every organization. Therefore, there is no gain saying that organizations need potential, talented, experience, quality applicants to ensure future success of the organisation in terms of productivity. An effective recruitment or right candidate in right job or position is the backbone of any organization of which without, the organization will not be able to stand against competitions [16]. In the same vein, [6] in his study averred that talent management has become an area of increasing concern where there is a need for practicing due diligence in the recruitment strategy in order to meet the demands of organisation that needs a specific skill in an area for greater productivity. He also suggested that organisations should make an effort to build effective, practical and holistic talent strategies which not only able to attract talent but also address employee engagement and the retention of key skills which boosts the employee productivity and business performance.

[28], posit that the process of recruiting potential and talented employee requires the best practice of human resources management in organisation. That this process require utmost care while appointing a recruiter for potential and talented candidates. That a recruiter should be very much cleared with the job description, key responsible areas, skill set needed in the candidates, qualification, experience pertaining to handle the current job so that he or she must understand, know how to start the new job and contribute positively to the organizational goals.
In the review of the literature, some of the literature related to the current study has been reviewed. In this regard, [17] studied staffing in the Nigerian local government system: the issues and solution. Also, [22] carried out a research on recruitment and selection practices in higher institutions of learning in Nigeria while [45] studied effectiveness of recruitment and selection practices in public sector higher education institutions, evidence from Ghana. Accordingly, [46] engaged in study on recruitment and selection strategies and processes in public sector organisations; perceptions and realities but none of them studied staff recruitment and productivity in local government in Enugu State. In the same vein, [7] studied staff recruitment and section process in the Nigeria public service. On the other hand, [20] studied recruitment and selection in the Nigeria public sector, nature, challenges and way forward. Moreso, [28] investigated staff welfare and productivity in Patani Local Government council, Delta State Nigeria. In the same regard, [11] did research project on the effects of recruitment and selection procedures on the efficiency of the public service in Nigeria, a study of Oshimili South Local Government of Delta State, while [14] studied leadership and staff productivity improvement in the Nigeria public sector; the case of Enugu North local government. To the best knowledge of the researcher no one has researched on staff recruitment and productivity in the local government of Enugu State 1999-2021 and this prompted the research to delve into this study.

**METHODOLOGY**

**Theoretical Framework**

**Human Resource Management Theory**

This study will be anchored on human resource management theory. The human resource management theory was developed by Frederick Winslow Taylor in the late 18th Century. In his monograph “the principles of scientific management.” Published in 1911, Taylor argued that flows in a given work place could be scientifically solved through improved management methods and that the best way to increase labour productivity was to optimize the manner in which the work was done. Taylor used scientific methods to analyze the most efficient production process in order to increase productivity. He went further to argue that it was the job of the workplace manager to develop the proper production system for achieving economic efficiency. In human resource management, Taylor’s philosophy focused on the conviction that getting the employees to work as hard as they could was not always the best way to get things done. He believed that there is only one best way to approach every job. Taylor explored and dissected the job and broke it down into individual components. He called it job specification. He believed people could be trained to become experts at one particular components of the job and Taylor maintained that there are people whom managers should seek to hire where possible. He stated that choosing the right person for the right job is a vital part of workplace effectiveness.

**Taylor outlined four principles of scientific managements as follows:**

1. Selection methods based on science, not rule of the thumb rather than allowing each individual worker the freedom to use their own rule of thumb, method to complete a task, you should instead use the scientific method to determine the one best way to do the job.

2. Assign workers job based on their aptitudes instead of randomly assigning workers to any open job, assess which one’s are most capable of each specific job and train them to work at peak efficiency.

3. Monitor workers performance: Assess your worker’s efficiency and provide additional instruction when necessary to guarantee that they are working productively.

4. Properly divide the workload between managers and workers. Managers should plan and train while workers should implement what they have been trained to do.

**Applicability of the Theory of Human Resource Management**

The human resource management theory is the most suitable theory to extrapolate this current study. Its uniqueness can be seen when Taylor advocated for assigning worker’s job based on their aptitudes instead of randomly assigning worker to any open job. That job should be assigned to most capable of each specific job and train them to work in order to achieve effectiveness and efficiency (productivity). In other words, to entrench productivity in the local government in Enugu State, efforts must geared towards recruiting right person (staff) into a right position. Just as Taylor emphasized on most capable to fill the right position to guarantee productivity. It is assumed that if the heads or those recruiting for local government can abide by the dictates of human resource management theory, the local government in Enugu State will become effective and efficient in service delivery.

**Hypothesis**

1. There is a relationship between staff recruitment and productivity in Enugu State local government system.
The process of recruitment of staff in the local government system of Enugu State promotes productivity.

**Research Design**

The researcher adopted a descriptive survey design for this study. According to [47], descriptive survey research design is one in which a group of people or items will be studied by collecting and analysing data from only a few people considered to be representative of the entire group. This design is suitable for this study because it will involve the collection of data from a sample of residents of Enugu State in order to ascertain the relationship between staff recruitment and low productivity in local government areas in Enugu State.

**Population for the Study**

The population for the study consists of 4,411,100 residents in the 17 local government areas of Enugu State. This comprises 1,575,100 residents in Enugu East Senatorial District, 1,660,000 in Enugu West Senatorial District, and 1,176,000 in Enugu North Senatorial District [48].

**Sample and Sampling Techniques**

The sample for the study was 450 residents of Enugu State. The sample size was obtained through multi stage sampling techniques. First, the researcher adopted stratified sampling technique which enabled the researcher to divide the state into three senatorial districts, Enugu North, Enugu West, and Enugu East Senatorial Districts. The researcher randomly selected Uzo-Uwani, Ezeagu and Enugu South Local Government Areas. The researcher lastly applied clustered sampling technique to obtain information from one hundred and fifty (150) respondents from each local government area that represent each of three senatorial districts making it four hundred and fifty (450) respondents from Enugu State.

**Method of Data Collection**

The researcher with the help of three briefed research assistant administered research questionnaires to respondents and collected it on spot. There was hundred percent turn of instrument of data collection.

**Method of Data Analysis**

The researcher already adopted descriptive survey research design. This allowed the use of questionnaire in data collection. The rating scale in the questionnaire was determined through the use of mean statistics and standard deviation. Nominal values were assigned to different scaling statement as follows:

- Strongly Agree = 4
- Agree = 3
- Disagree = 2
- Strongly Disagree = 1

A cut-off was determined by finding the mean of the nominal values assigned to the options in each question items using the formula:

\[
\bar{X} = \frac{\sum f_i x_i}{N}
\]

Where \( \bar{X} \) = mean score

Thus, \( \bar{X} = \frac{4 + 3 + 2 + 1}{4} = \frac{10}{4} = 2.5 \)

**Decision Rule**

The decision rule is that any mean score of 2.5 and above will be regarded as high, while score below 2.5 will be regard as low.

**EMPIRICAL VERIFICATION**

The Relationship between Staff Recruitment and Productivity in the Local Government System of Enugu State

This section set to examine the relationship between staff recruitment and productivity in the local government areas in Enugu State. The population of Enugu State was 4,440,100 as at 2016 [48]. The sample for the study was four hundred and fifty (450) respondents. The researcher in a bide to ensure that major components of the state were represented divided the local government along three senatorial districts, thereby collecting one hundred and fifty (150) respondents from each zone making it four hundred and fifty respondents. The total number of the question was nine (9) and below is the analysis of the data collected. However, the respondents were asked to select the rate which represent their opinion on the relationship between staff recruitment and productivity in local government in Enugu State. The like – type scale was used to rate their level of responses on a 4 – point scale rating from 4 = strongly Agree, 3 = Agree, 2 = Disagree and 1 = Strongly Disagree.
Results in table 4.1 indicated that local governments staff in Enugu State were not under recruited from 1999-2021. Accordingly, five (5) respondents strongly agreed while seven (7) only agreed. On the other hand, one hundred (100) respondents disagreed and three hundred and thirty eight strongly disagreed that local government staff were not under recruited. The decision on item number one was that staff were not unrecruited in the local government and thus does not lead to low productivity. On item number two, productivity was considered in local government staff recruitment. Three (3) respondents strongly agreed that productivity was considered while thirteen (13) respondents agreed. In the opposing side, ninety five (95) respondents disagreed while thirty three and thirty nine (339) respondents strongly disagreed. The decision was that productivity was not considered during staff recruitment in Local Government of Enugu State. Moreso, on item number three (3) local government staff recruitment was not politicised from 1999-2021. Findings indicated that fifteen (15) respondents strongly agreed while thirty five (35) respondents agreed. Meanwhile, one hundred and five (105) respondents disagreed, while two hundred and ninety five (295) strongly disagreed. Decision was that the respondents disagreed that local government staff were not politicised from 1999-2021 on item number four (4). Staff recruitment was based on competent and professionalism. In all, seven (7) respondents strongly agreed while eighteen (18) respondents agreed. One hundred and one (111) respondents disagreed. On related development, three hundred and fourteen (314) respondent strongly disagreed.

The decision was that the recruitment was not based on competent and professionalism and this led to low productivity. Furthermore, item five (5) seeks the opinions of respondents on staff recruitment not based on clans and communities. Fifty one (51) respondents strongly agreed, seventy seven (77) agreed while a total of ninety seven (97) disagree and two hundred and twenty five (225) strongly disagreed. The decision was that the recruitment was based on clans and communities. The item six (6) which was on staff recruitment was not based on highest bidder. The findings indicated that thirty seven (37) respondents strongly agreed while sixty seven (67) agreed. One hundred and thirteen (113) disagreed while two hundred and thirty three (333) strongly disagreed. The decision was that respondents disagreed on staff recruitment was not based on highest bidder. Also, on item seven (7), advertisement were properly done before recruitment. Eight (8) respondents strongly agreed while thirty eight (38) respondents agreed. On the other hand, one hundred and eight (180) respondents disagreed while two hundred and twenty four (224) strongly disagreed. The decision was that there were no proper advertisement for staff recruitment in local government in Enugu State. Moreover, item eight (8) newly recruited staff were properly trained for service delivery before posting. Two (2) respondents strongly agreed while seven (7) respondents agreed. Also, two hundred and one (201) disagreed while two hundred and forty (240) respondents strongly disagreed. The decision was that the respondents disagreed on proper training of newly recruited staff for service deliver before

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>ITEMS DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>DEC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Local government staff were under recruited since 1999 to 2021 and this lead to low productivity.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>338</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Productivity was considered in local government staff recruitment.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>339</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Local government staff recruitment was not politicized from 1999-2021</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Staff recruitment was based on competent and professionalism.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>314</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Staff recruitment was not based on clan/communities.</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Staff recruitment was not based on highest bidder.</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Advertisement were properly done before recruitment.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Newly recruited staff were properly trained for service delivery before posting.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Staff were provided with tools and equipment for efficiency before posting.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>222</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Local government usually follow due process in staff recruitment</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: SA = Strongly Agree;  A = Agree; D = Disagree; SD = Strong Disagree; X = Mean; and Dec = Decision.
Anikwe et al.

posting. The item (9), new staff were provided with tools and equipment for efficiency before posting. There was no strong agree while two (9) agreed. Accordingly, two hundred and twenty two (222) respondents disagreed, and two hundred and twenty six (226) strongly disagreed. Decision on item (9) was that the respondents indicated highest level of disagreement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITEMS DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>DEC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grand mean of standard deviation</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>1454</td>
<td>2654</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Decision Hypotheses rejected.

Ho. 1: The grand mean and standard deviation calculated indicated that 128 opinions of Enugu residents strongly agreed that there is no relationship between staff recruitment and low productivity in local government in Enugu State while two hundred and sixty four (264) agreed. On the other hand, one thousand four hundred and fifty four (1454) disagreed while two thousand six hundred and fifty four (2654) strongly disagreed. Decision, the hypothesis was rejected.

Ho. 2: The process of staff recruitment into local government system promotes productivity. Based on the responses of the respondents, the question, whether local government do observe due process during staff recruitment, none of them strongly agreed or agreed to that. Conversely, two hundred and thirty (230) respondents disagreed while two hundred and twenty (220), respondents strongly disagreed. Basically, no one agreed nor strongly agreed that the process of local government staff recruitment was properly done. Accordingly, all the respondents disagreed that the recruitment process follow due process. This is also in line with the assertion of Okoli Sussan who observed that politicians usually brought new staff in their tenure without proper advertisement. Also, the statement of Nwke Sunday validated this point when he posited that local government chairman recruit staff at will without considering productivity. Decision hypothesis 2 rejected.

Discussion of the Findings

The findings of the study revealed that staff were not under recruited from 1999-2021 local system in Enugu State. This was also in line with the submission of [11] who’s study revealed that staff were not under recruited in Oshimili Local Government Area of Delta State. [46], pointed out that recruitment in higher institution in Ghana does not consider productivity rather it was being influenced by some other factors. This was in line with the findings of this study which revealed that productivity was not given adequate consideration in recruitment process in the local government in Enugu State. Also, [22] examined recruitment and selection practices in higher institutions of learning in Nigeria, the study revealed that politics was a regular feature of who gets job. In another study, politicization of recruitment and selection processes in Oshimili South Local Government Area. The study revealed that people get job as a result of personal connection or who can offer highest money. This is explicated in theory of (Tombon connection) or what [49] described as “Cognitive Melodrama” in a nutshell, [49] observed that hardly can any Nigeria get a job, a favour or any other thing of value without knowing somebody, or somebody who know, who knows somebody. This is in line with the findings of this study which revealed that the process of recruitment in the local government in Enugu State was politicized. The current study discovered that competent and professionalism was never criteria for recruitment in local government in Enugu State. This is in agreement with the findings of Odor, Emeson and Bakwuye which revealed that there was no effort to recruit staff based on merit.

Accordingly, the finding of this study revealed that clan and community were placed above productivity. This is consistent with the findings of [11] who’s findings indicated that recruitment and selection procedure in the public service in Nigeria has been ineffective following the introduction of informal processes such as federal character, quota system, states, indigene ship, son of soil, ethnicity, favours among others. In addition, [7] stated that recruitment and selection into the public service of Nigeria are guided by the federal character principles. Moreover, [17] in her study indicated that most of the staff in the local government pay money before getting job and this is in line with the findings of Ikwesi who identified money as a fastest way of securing job in public place in Ghana. The findings of this study also indicated that recruitment of staff were based on highest bidder in local government in Enugu State. Moreso, [45] examined the recruitment and selection practices of public sector higher education institutions in Ghana, the findings from the study showed that public sector higher education institutions in Ghana predominantly rely on recommendation (Friend/Family) in publicising vacancy in the university. This is in line with the current finding of this study which indicated that advertisement were poorly done before recruitment. Conversely, [50] posited that advertisement especially in the leading national newspapers seems to be frequently employed as means of recruitment but in contrast, this study revealed that connections and informal contacts dominated recruitment process in local government in Enugu State. Furthermore, [28] studied staff welfare and productivity in Patani Local Government Area Council, Delta State, the findings showed that staff training is strange to workers at the council and it is worrisome in light of its possible negative effect on employee...
productivity. This is consistent with the findings of the study which indicated that newly recruited staff were not properly trained before posting to enhance productivity. Meanwhile, the findings of this study indicated that newly recruited staff were not provided with tools for job performance and this is in contrast with the findings of [20] which stated that availability of office equipment enhance productivity in any organization be it private or public.

CONCLUSION

Recruitment and selection process in Nigerian Local Government is highly subjective since there is significantly no objective measure with regards to productivity in the assessment of candidate to be placed on employment. Recruitment of staff is more often based on connection with the politicians or influential persons in the society. This is why employment vacancies in the local government are poorly advertised or in some cases to fulfil official bureaucratic requirement. However, personnel function is a critical factor in the attainment of the goals of local government, hence good organisation structure does not by itself guarantee productivity. Offices, computers, files and other equipment remain unproductive except for human efforts and direction. So, the ability of personnel to contribute to the attainment of the goals of local government depends to a large extent on how well they are recruited, their quality and how they are managed. Therefore, there is a dire need for a review of recruitment processes and selection in the local government to ensure that only the best are selected to fill vacancies. In other to achieve this, a well-planned recruitment process of selection of employees is absolutely in order to fill vacancies with right person.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The study recommended that efforts should be made to ensure that right candidates are recruited to enhance productivity in the local government system in Enugu State.

REFERENCES

2. Ofonze, H. (2002). Local Government in Nigeria and Historical Discourse, Enugu: John Jacob's Class Publisher LTB.


Anikwe et al.
